The bulk of research on work identity has focused on one’s current identity - the identity that employees enact through the activities and interactions that are part of their current role. In conceptual and qualitative papers, Obodaru (2012, 2017) suggested that forgone identities - self-representations of who one could have been if things had happened differently - might also shape employees’ current reactions. In a four-wave, three-source field study, we examine the potential negative effects of unfavorable comparisons between one’s current and forgone identities. Specifically, we argue that employees for whom “the identity grass is greener” may react with longing and resentment that makes them more callous to those around them. We further argue that such reactions will be more intense when their current circumstances are attributed to fate, the universe, or some sort of higher power.